# **EXHIBIT D**

Case 2:25-cv-01138-AH-E Document 44-4 Filed 09/08/25 Page 2 of 14 Page ID

## NOSB NATIONAL LIST FILE CHECKLIST

## **PROCESSING**

MATERIAL NAME: Citric Acid				
CATEGORY: Synthe	tic Allowed Complete?: 3/16			
	NOSB Database Form			
	References			
	MSDS (or equivalent)			
	FASP (FDA)			
	Date file mailed out:1/8/95			
	TAP Reviews from: Struce Taylor Struck Harper			
8	Bob Durst			
Additional	Supplemental Information:			
hierobial Som only				
becous	of Substrate might be			
and the second				
FIGURE DISCOULTER	ION			

## NOSB/NATIONAL LIST COMMENT FORM/BALLOT

Use this page to write down comments and questions regarding the data presented in the file of this National List material. Also record your planned opinion/vote to save time at the meeting on the National List.

Name of Material	CITTIC	Heid		
Type of Use:	_ Crops;	Livestock	(; <u></u>	Processing
TAP Review by:				
1. stev	e Taylor	n Annija diplom opinar spanja spirita skulta patrim skimat tiletik	1000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 000 00	
2. Stee	en Harper			
1	Durst	and a property of the second s		
Comments/Questio	ns:			
My Opinion/Vote	is:			<u> </u>
Signature		Date	·	

# USDA/TAP REVIEWER COMMENT FORM

Use this page or an equivalent to write down comments and summarize your evaluation regarding the data presented in the file of this potential National List material. Attach additional sheets if you wish.

This file is due back to us within 30 days of: Jan 7
Name of Material: Citric Acid  Reviewer Name: Steve Taylor
Is this substance Natural or Synthetic? Explain (If appropriate)
Natural
Please comment on the accuracy of the information in the file:
This material should be added to the National List as: Synthetic Allowed Prohibited Natural
or, This material does not belong on the National List because:
Are there any restrictions or limitations that should be placed on this material by use or application on the National List?  Made by fermentation. Fermentation is natural but process does any involve use of other substances: Substrates: corn syrup, sucro Any additional comments or references? ammonium bicarborate
Need to find out more about process and processing aids to make determination.  Signature Start Tought Date 3-5-95

## USDA/TAP REVIEWER COMMENT FORM

Use this page or an equivalent to write down comments and summarize your evaluation regarding the data presented in the file of this potential National List material. Attach additional sheets if you wish.

This file is due back to us within 30 days of: In 7				
Name of Material:	Citric Acid			
Reviewer Name:	Steven Harper			
ls this substance N	latural or Synthetic? Explain (if appropriate			
Synthetic				
Please comment on th	e accuracy of the information in the file:			
Good				
or, This	Allowed Prohibited Natural material does not belong on the Nationa			
Are there any restr placed on this mat National List?	rictions or limitations that should be erial by use or application on the			
No.				
Any additional com	ments or references?			

then hayper Date 3/10/as

# Case 2:25-cv-01138-AH-E Document 44-4 Filed 09/08/25 Page 6 of 14 Page ID USDA/TAP Reviewer Comment Form

Material: Citric acid
Reviewer: Bob Durst
Is this substance Natural or Synthetic? Explain (if appropriate)  It is a natural occurring substance that commercially goes through numerous chemical processes to get to it's final usable form. This processing would suggest that it be classified as synthetic.
Please comment on the accuracy of the information in the file:
The file is accurate.
This material should be added to the National List as:
X Synthetic Allowed,
Prohibited Natural, or
This material does not belong on the National List because:
Are there any restriction or limitations that should be placed on this material by use or application on the National List?
Must be listed on the ingredient label if it used used.
Unless it is actually derived from a natural source the labeling must not indicate that it is a natural compound.
Any additional comments or references?
As with all synthetic inorganic salts, source must be food grade. In addition each lot should be analyzed for toxic element concentrations (mercury, lead, cadmium, arsenic, thallium and antimony) and a near zero tolerance adopted.
Since citrus juices are a high natural source of citric acid, it might be advisable to find a manufacturer that is willing to isolate citric acid from organically grown fruit in an organically acceptable manner, and get a natural citric acid.
Signature Robert W. Date 3/4/95

#:621

## **NOSB Materials Database**

## **Identification**

Common Name Citric Acid Chemical Name B-

Chemical Name B-hydroxy-tricarboxylic acid C6H8O7

Other Names

Citric Acid, Anhydrous USP/FCC

Code #: CAS

77-92-9

Code #: Other

21 CFR 182-1033

N. L. Category

Synthetic Allowed

MSDS

yes Ono

## **Chemistry**

Family

Aliphatic Acid

Composition

C<sub>6</sub>H<sub>8</sub>O<sub>7</sub>

**Properties** 

Colorless, translucent crystals, (or) white granular to fine crystalline powder, odorless, strong acid taste.

How Made

Traditionally by extraction from citrus juice, no longer commercially available. It is now extracted by fermentation of a carbohydrate substrate (often molasses) by citric acid bacteria, Aspergillus niger (a mold) or Candida guilliermondii (a yeast). Citric acid is recovered from the fermentation broth by a lime

and suffuric acid process in which the citric acid is first precipitated as a calcium salt and then

reacidulated with sulfuric acid.

## **Use/Action**

Type of Use

Processing

Specific Use(s)

Production of fruit products, juices, oils, fats etc. for pH control, flavor enhancer, flavoring agent or adjuvant, leavening agent, sequestrant, antioxidant, solvent, antimicrogial agent, surface-active agent.

Action

Optimizes stability of frozen foods by enhancing the action of antioxidants and inactivating enzymes. Brings out flavor in carbonated beverages. Acts as a synergist for antioxidants employed in inhibiting

rancidity in foods containg fats and oils.

Combinations

pure substance

## **Status**

**OFPA** 

N. L. Restriction

Currently considered synthetic by NOSB.

EPA, FDA, etc

FDA -GRAS

Directions

Safety Guidelines

Eye irritant, dust may cause mild respiratory irritation.

State Differences

Historical status

Always been allowed in organic processing and considered natural.

Internation | status

Allowed by IFOAM, EU and Codex.

## **NOSB Materials Database**

## OFPA Criteria

2119(m)1: chemical interactions

Not Applicable

2119(m)2: toxicity & persistence

Not Applicable

2119(m)3: manufacture & disposal consequences

Microbial fermentation --Clarification --Precipitation --Dissolution --Crystallization --Drying --Sifting --packaging. The NOSB judged that citric acid produced by natural fermentation of carbohydrate substrates and purified by the lime-sulfuric method is synthetic because the citric acid comes into contact with time and sulfuric acid and because of the chemical change from citric acid to calcium citrate and then back to citric acid during purification.

Biomass residuals are usually recycled as animal feeds and for agriculture.

#### 2119(m)4: effect on human health

Material has been affirmed as GRAS by FDA for use in foods. The amount of citrate added to foods by food processors is about 500 mg per person per day. This amount occurs naturally in 2 ounces of orange juice and does not constitute a significant addition to the total body load.

Long term oral over exposure may cause damage to tooth enamel. Considered an irritatant to eyes and respiratory system during manufacture and handling. Recommended use of eye and respiratory protection during handling. Oral LD50 (rat) 11,700 mg/kg; dermal (acute) tested on skin of rabbit 500mg/24 hr moderate; eye 750 mg/24hr severe. FDA tests show no effect on reproduction, teratogenicity or oncogenicity in rats.

2119(m)5: agroecosystem biology

Not Applicable

2119(m)6: alternatives to substance

Lactic acid (has some taste problems and not used in infant foods).

Vinegar (strange taste in some foods).

Citrus juices.

2119(m)7: Is it compatible?

Compatible

## References

- 1. FDA. 1977. Evaluation of the health aspects of citric acid, sodium citrate, potassium citrate, calcium citrate, ammonium citrate, triethyl citrate, isopropyl citrate, and stearyl citrate as food ingredients. SCOGS-84. Life Science Research Office, 9650 Rockville Pike, Bethesda, Maryland 20014.
- 2. Ag Partners of Davis, Materials Report for Citric Acid, 1995. Organic Trade Association, Greenfield, MA

#:623

6.

MSDS for CITRIC ACID, MONOHYDRATE Page 1 1 - PRODUCT IDENTIFICATION PRODUCT NAME: CITRIC ACID, MONOHYDRATE FORMULA: HOC(COOH)(CH2COOH)2 H2O FORMULA WT: CAS NO .: 5949-29-1 COMMON SYNONYMS: 2-HYDROXY-1,2,3,PROPANE-TRICARBOXYLIC ACID, MONOHYDRATE PRODUCT CODES: 0118,0120,0119,0110 EFFECTIVE: 12/01/86 **REVISION #02** PRECAUTIONARY LABELLING BAKER SAF-T-DATA(TM) SYSTEM HEALTH - 0 NONE FLAMMABILITY - 1 SLIGHT REACTIVITY - 0 NONE CONTACT - 1 SLIGHT HAZARD RATINGS ARE 0 TO 4 (0 = NO HAZARD; 4 = EXTREME HAZARD). LABORATORY PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT: SAFETY GLASSES; LAB COAT PRECAUTIONARY LABEL STATEMENTS CAUTION MAY CAUSE IRRITATION DURING USE AVOID CONTACT WITH EYES, SKIN, CLOTHING. WASH THOROUGHLY AFTER HANDLING. WHEN NOT IN USE KEEP IN TIGHTLY CLOSED CONTAINER. SAF-T-DATA(TM) STORAGE COLOR CODE: ORANGE (GENERAL STORAGE) 2 - HAZARDOUS COMPONENTS COMPONENT % CASNO. CITRIC ACID, MONOHYDRATE 05949-29-1 3 - PHYSICAL DATA BOILING POINT: N/A

MELTING POINT: N/A

SPECIFIC GRAVITY: 1.54

(H2O=1)

WAPOR PRESSURE(MM HG): N/A

VAPOR DENSITY(AIR=1): N/A

EVAPORATION RATE: N/A

(BUTYL ACETATE=1) SOLUBILITY(H2O): APPRECIABLE (MORE THAN 10 %) % VOLATILES BY VOLUME: 0 APPEARANCE & ODOR: WHITE, ODORLESS POWDER. 4 - FIRE AND EXPLOSION HAZARD DATA FLASH POINT (CLOSED CUP N/A FLAMMABLE LIMITS: UPPER - N/A % LOWER - N/A % FIRE EXTINGUISHING MEDIA USE WATER SPRAY, CARBON DIOXIDE, DRY CHEMICAL OR ORDINARY FOAM. SPECIAL FIRE-FIGHTING PROCEDURES FIREFIGHTERS SHOULD WEAR PROPER PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT AND SELF-CONTAINED

BREATHING APPARATUS WITH FULL FACEPIECE OPERATED IN POSITIVE PRESSURE MODE.

TOXIC GASES PRODUCED: CARBON MONOXIDE, CARBON DIOXIDE

#### 5 - HEALTH HAZARD DATA

TOXICITY TEST RESULTS AND SAFETY AND HEALTH EFFECTS ARE LISTED FOR THE ANHYDROUS PRODUCT.

TOXICITY: LD50 (ORAL-RAT)(G/KG)

LD50 (IPR-RAT)(MG/KG) - 883 LD50 (SCU-RAT)(MG/KG) - 5500

LD50 (ORAL-MOUSE)(MG/KG) - 5040

CARCINOGENICITY: NTP: NO IARC: NO Z LIST: NO OSHA REG: NO

EFFECTS OF OVEREXPOSURE

DUST MAY IRRITATE NOSE AND THROAT.

DUST MAY CAUSE HEADACHE, COUGHING, DIZZINESS OR DIFFICULT BREATHING.

DUST MAY IRRITATE OR BURN MUCOUS MEMBRANES.

CONTACT WITH SKIN OR EYES MAY CAUSE IRRITATION.

TARGET ORGANS: EYES, SKIN

MEDICAL CONDITIONS GENERALLY AGGRAVATED BY EXPOSURE: NONE IDENTIFIED ROUTES OF ENTRY: INHALATION, EYE CONTACT, SKIN CONTACT

EMERGENCY AND FIRST AID PROCEDURES

INGESTION: IF SWALLOWED AND THE PERSON IS CONSCIOUS, IMMEDIATELY GIVE LARGE AMOUNTS OF WATER. GET MEDICAL ATTENTION.

INHALATION: IF A PERSON BREATHES IN LARGE AMOUNTS, MOVE THE EXPOSED PERSON TO FRESH AIR. GET MEDICAL ATTENTION.

EYE CONTACT: IMMEDIATELY FLUSH WITH PLENTY OF WATER FOR AT LEAST 15 MINUTES. GET MEDICAL ATTENTION.

SKIN CONTACT: IMMEDIATELY WASH WITH PLENTY OF SOAP AND WATER FOR AT LEAST 15 MINUTES.

#### 6 - REACTIVITY DATA

STABILITY: STABLE HAZARDOUS POLYMERIZATION: WILL NOT OCCUR INCOMPATIBLES: STRONG BASES

DECOMPOSITION PRODUCTS: CARBON MONOXIDE, CARBON DIOXIDE

#### 7 - SPILL AND DISPOSAL PROCEDURES

STEPS TO BE TAKEN IN THE EVENT OF A SPILL OR DISCHARGE WEAR SUITABLE PROTECTIVE CLOTHING. CAREFULLY SWEEP UP AND REMOVE. DISPOSAL PROCEDURE

DISPOSE IN ACCORDANCE WITH ALL APPLICABLE FEDERAL, STATE, AND LOCAL ENVIRONMENTAL REGULATIONS.

#### 8 - PROTECTIVE EQUIPMENT

VENTILATION: USE ADEQUATE GENERAL OR LOCAL EXHAUST VENTILATION TO KEEP FUME OR DUST LEVELS AS LOW AS POSSIBLE.

RESPIRATORY PROTECTION: NONE REQUIRED WHERE ADEQUATE VENTILATION CONDITIONS EXIST. IF AIRBORNE CONCENTRATION IS

HIGH, USE AN APPROPRIATE RESPIRATOR OR DUST MASK.

EYE/SKIN PROTECTION: SAFETY GLASSES WITH SIDESHIELDS, NITRILE GLOVES RECOMMENDED.

9 - STORAGE AND HANDLING PRECAUTIONS

-----

SAF-T-DATA(TM) STORAGE COLOR CODE: ORANGE (GENERAL STORAGE) SPECIAL PRECAUTIONS

KEEP CONTAINER TIGHTLY CLOSED. SUITABLE FOR ANY GENERAL CHEMICAL STORAGE AREA.

10 - TRANSPORTATION DATA AND ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

DOMESTIC (D.O.T.)

PROPER SHIPPING NAME CHEMICALS, N.O.S. (NON-REGULATED)

INTERNATIONAL (I.M.O.)

PROPER SHIPPING NAME CHEMICALS, N.O.S. (NON-REGULATED)

05 MAY 94 DOCNUM=1937

PAGE 1

## U.S. FOOD AND DRUG ADMINISTRATION FOOD ADDITIVE SAFETY PROFILE

CITRIC ACID 000077929 HUMAN CONSUMPTION; MARKET DISAPPEARANCE: MARKET SURVEY: 90.5367 MG/KG BM/DAY/PERSON 106833333.333LBS/YR 87 FASP#: TYPE: NAS#: FEMA#: 1937 ASP 2306 JECFA: JECFA ADI: JECFA ESTABLISHED: 2306 MG/KG BW/DAY/PERSON 1979 931115 POTENTIAL BEVERAGE USE LAST UPDATE: FW: 192.12 DENSITY: LOGP: STRUCTURE CATEGORIES: COMPONENTS: CITRIC ACID, ANHYDROUS
2-HYDROXY-1,2,3-PROPANETRICARBOXYLIC ACID
HYDROXYTRICARBOXYLIC ACID, BETA1,2,3-PROPANETRICARBOXYLIC ACID, 2-HYDROXYACIDE CITRIQUE SYNONYMS: CHEMICAL FUNCTION: F PH CONTROL AGENT FLAVOR ENHANCER FLAVORING AGENT OR ADJUVANT LEAVENING AGENT TECHNICAL EFFECT: SEQUESTRANT ANTIOXIDANT SOLVENT OR VEHICLE SURFACE-ACTIVE AGENT ANTIMICROBIAL AGENT ENZYME 173.165 182.1033 CFR REG NUMBERS: 172.755 PART 133 PART 169 182.6033 PART 146 PART 150 161.190 131.111 155.130 131.138 146.187 166.40 169.150 145.131 131.146 150.141 169.140 150.161 169.115 173.160 166.110 MINIMUM TESTING LEVEL: 3 COMMENTS: STUDY 1-12 FROM SCOGS-84 BOX 4A: LOWEST EFFECT LEVEL OBSERVED IN ALL AVAILABLE RAT OR MOUSE STUDIES STUDY: SPECIES: RANKING FACTOR: 1.938E-2 LEL: 4670 MG/KG BW/ COMPLETENESS: SPECIES: RAT

EFFECTS: CHOLESTEROL DECREASE
GLUTAMIC-OXALOACETIC TRANSAMINASE (SGOT/AST) INCREASE
ORGAN WEIGHT DECREASE
CELLULAR ATROPHY
THYMUS
SPLEEN
COMMENTS: MALES ONLY
SLIGHT ATROPHY OF THYMUS AND SPLENIC FOLLICLES
DATA FROM SCOGS-84 MG/KG BW/DAY

05 MAY 94

```
10.
```

PAGE

```
DOCNUM=1937
                LOWEST EFFECT LEVEL OBSERVED IN ALL AVAILABLE STUDIES
BOX 4C:
                                                                    RANKING FACTOR: 1.938E-2
LEL: 4670 MG/KG BW/DAY
STUDY:
SPECIES:
                                       COMPLETENESS:
                 CHOLESTEROL DECREASE
GLUTAMIC-OXALOACETIC TRANSAMINASE (SGOT/AST) INCREASE
ORGAN WEIGHT DECREASE
CELLULAR ATROPHY
EFFECTS:
                 THYMUS
SITES:
STIES: INTMUS
SPLEEN
COMMENTS: MALES ONLY
SLIGHT ATROPHY OF THYMUS AND SPLENIC FOLLICLES
DATA FROM SCOGS-84
                 ACUTE TOXICITY INFORMATION
 BOX 7:
                                                                     SOURCE: J TAKEDA RES LAB 30:25-31
YEAR: 1971
LD50: 12000 MG/KG BW
STUDY: 2
SPECIES: RAT
 STUDY:
 COMMENTS:
                                                                     SOURCE: J TAKEDA RES LAB 30:25-31
YEAR: 1971
LD50: 5000 MG/KG BW
 STUDY: 1
SPECIES: MOUSE
 COMMENTS:
                  ORAL TOXICITY STUDIES (OTHER THAN ACUTE)
                                                                     SOURCE: REV PORT FARM 20:41-46
YEAR: 1970
LEL: 200 MG/KG BW/DAY
 STUDY:
TYPE:
SPECIES:
                                        COMPLETENESS:
 SPECIES: RAT
DURATION: 9 DAYS
EFFECTS: BODY WEIGHT DECREASE
SITES:
                  SHORT TERM
                                                                      HNEL:
 COMMENTS: INITIAL DECREASE IN WEIGHT DID NOT PERSIST NOT USED FOR PRIORITY RANKING
                                                                      SOURCE: J TAKEDA RES LAB 30:25-31
YEAR: 1971
LEL: 4670 MG/KG BM/DAY
                                        COMPLETENESS:
  STUDY:
                  4
SHORT TERM
  TYPE:
SPECIES:
 TYPE: SHORT TERM YEAR: 1971
SPECIES: RAT LEL: 4670 MG/KG BW,
DURATION: 42 DAYS HNEL: 2260 MG/KG BW,
EFFECTS: CHOLESTEROL DECREASE
GLUTAMIC-OXALOACETIC TRANSAMINASE (SGOT/AST) INCREASE
ORGAN WEIGHT DECREASE
CELLULAR ATROPHY
SITES: THYMUS
COMMENTS: SLIGHT ATROPHY OF THYMUS AND SPLENIC FOLLICLES
                                                                                                MG/KG BW/DAY
                                                                      SOURCE: J AM PHARM ASSOC SCI ED
                                         COMPLETENESS:
  STUDY:
                                                                                    34:86-89
  TYPE: SUBCHRONIC RODENT SPECIES: RAT DURATION: 90 DAYS EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS
                                                                      YEAR:
                                                                                 1945
                                                                                                MG/KG BW/DAY
                                                                      LEL: >
HNEL: 600
  COMPLETENESS: SOURCE: J AM PHARM ASSOC SCI ED 34:86-89

TYPE: SUBCHRONIC MAMMAL (NON-RODENT) YEAR: 1945
SPECIES: DOG LEL: > MG/KG BW/DAY
DURATION: 112 DAYS HNEL: 1380 MG/KG BW/DAY
EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS
SITES:
   COMMENTS: BODY WEIGHT, BLOOD, HISTOPATH AND REPRODUCTION OBSERVED
   COMMENTS: NO BEHAVIORAL, BIOCHEMICAL OR HISTOPATHOLOGICAL ABNORMALITIES
                                                                       SOURCE: GRP 7T0195 3
YEAR: 1973
LEL: > MG/KG
                    10 COMPLETENESS:
   STUDY:
   TYPE:
SPECIES:
                                                                                                 MG/KG BW/DAY
                    RAT
```

05 MAY 94

11.

```
PAGE 3
 DOCNUM=1937
 DURATION: 10 DAYS
EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS
SITES:
                                                                  HNEL: 295
                                                                                           MG/KG BW/DAY
 COMMENTS: ADMINISTERED DAY 6-15 OF GESTATION
 STUDY:
                                       COMPLETENESS:
                                                                   SOURCE: GRP 7T0195 3
TYPE: TERATOGENIC
SPECIES: MOUSE
DURATION: 10 DAYS
EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS
                  TERATOGENICITY
                                                                   YEAR: 1973
LEL: >
                                                                                           MG/KG BW/DAY
MG/KG BW/DAY
                                                                   LEL: >
HNEL: 241
 COMMENTS: ADMINISTERED DAY 6-15 OF GESTATION
STUDY: 11 CONTROL OF TERATOGENICITY SPECIES: HAMSTER DURATION: 5 DAYS EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS SITES:
                                                                  SOURCE: GRP 7T0195 3
YEAR: 1973
LEL: > MG/KG
HNEL: 272 MG/KG
                                       COMPLETENESS:
                                                                                           MG/KG BW/DAY
 COMMENTS: ADMINISTERED DAY 6-10 OF GESTATION
STUDY: 12 CONTROL OF TERATOGENICITY SPECIES: RABBIT DURATION: 13 DAYS EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS SITES:
                                       COMPLETENESS:
                                                                  SOURCE: GRP 7T0195 3
YEAR: 1973
LEL: > MG/KG
                                                                  LEL: >
HNEL: 425
                                                                                          MG/KG BW/DAY
 COMMENTS: ADMINISTERED DAY 6-18 OF GESTATION
                                                                  SOURCE: J AGRIC FOOD CHEM 5:759-760
YEAR: 1957
LEL: > MG/KG BW/DAY
STUDY:
                                      COMPLETENESS:
TYPE: RAT ONCOGES
SPECIES: RAT
DURATION: 728 DAYS
EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS
SITES:
                 RAT ONCOGENICITY
                                                                                          MG/KG BW/DAY
                                                                  LEL: >
HNEL: 2000
COMMENTS: MALES ONLY
STUDY: 7
TYPE: REPRODUCTION
SPECIES: RAT
DURATION:
EFFECTS: NO EFFECTS
SITES:
COMMENTS:
                 7
REPRODUCTION (3-GENERATION)
                                                                  SOURCE: VOEDING 17:137-148
YEAR: 1956
LEL: > MG/KG BW/DA
                                                                  LEL: >
HNEL: 800
                                                                                          MG/KG BW/DAY
                                                                                          MG/KG BW/DAY
BOX 3:
                GENETIC TOXICITY STUDIES
STUDY:
                                      COMPLETENESS:
                                                                  SOURCE:
TYPE:
SPECIES:
DURATION:
EFFECTS:
CELLS:
                                                                  YEAR:
LEL:
                                                                                          MG/KG BW/DAY
                                                                  HNEL:
COMMENTS:
```